

Board of Environmental Safety
Department of Toxic Substances Control
California Environmental Protection Agency

Standing Order 2425-01

The Board of Environmental Safety (“Board”) is authorized to hear and decide appeals of Department of Toxic Substances Control (“DTSC”) decisions to grant, issue, modify or deny hazardous waste facility permits, including temporary authorizations, in accordance with Health and Safety Code section 25125.2 and California Code of Regulations, Title 22, Section 66271.72.

Rules for Administration of Appeals

~~(1).~~ Administration. -The Board Chair and Vice Chair shall direct staff of the Board in the orderly administration of the appeal. The Executive Officer, or a Board Chair-designated alternate, shall serve as a “Hearing Officer”, who may conduct status conferences and assist in the administration of these Rules. The Hearing Officer shall administer public hearings in accordance with rules for public hearings established by the Board in Standing Order 24-02. Motions are decided by the Board Chair and Vice Chair in accordance with ~~these~~the Rules set forth in this Order.

~~(2).~~ Appeal Forms. -The Board requires the use of forms in its appeal process, including to initiate appeals of decisions by DTSC to grant, issue, modify or deny hazardous waste facility permits. A standard form used to provide notice of the appeal of a decision by ~~DTSC’s Permitting Division~~DTSC to grant, issue, modify or deny a hazardous waste facility permit is attached hereto as Exhibit 1 (“Form BES 2301”). -A special form used only to provide notice of the appeal of a decision to grant or deny a temporary authorization is attached hereto as Exhibit 2 (“Form BES 2302”). -An Appeal Management Form used to support the meet and confer process is attached hereto as Exhibit 3 (“Form BES 2501”).

~~(3).~~ Administrative Record. The administrative record includes all materials listed in Section 66271.17 of Title 22 Regulations. To facilitate public participation in the Board’s Appeals Process, DTSC shall, to the greatest extent feasible, make available all administrative record materials in electronic format. To be considered complete pursuant to Rule 7, the administrative record shall also include particular materials, if any, as agreed upon in the meet and confer process referred to in Rule 6. Evidence presented at the public hearing should be limited to materials in the administrative record, as provided in Rule 2 of Standing Order 24-02. As used in this Order, the term “administrative record index” means an index of all materials in the administrative record with sufficient detail to identify the content of each document. Materials in the administrative record shall be consecutively Bates-numbered and such numbering shall be notated in the administrative record index.

4. Notice to ~~DTSC’s Permitting Division~~DTSC and Applicant. -The Clerk of the Board shall ~~immediately~~ notify ~~DTSC’s Permitting Division~~DTSC upon the filing of Form BES 2301 or Form BES 2302 and request DTSC to both compile the materials in the administrative record ~~– and provide public access to the administrative record materials, consistent with Rule 5.~~ Upon the filing of Form BES 2302, the Board Clerk will request a brief response from ~~DTSC’s Permitting~~

~~Division~~DTSC. The Clerk of the Board shall immediately notify the permit applicant of the filing of Form BES 2301 or Form BES 2302.

~~(4) Completion of~~5. Public Access to the Administrative Record. ~~DTSC's Permitting Division~~

~~(a) Within 30 days of request of the Clerk of the Board, DTSC shall compile the provide public access to all administrative record materials, and at the same time submit to all parties and the Clerk of the Board an index indicating which portions of the administrative record materials are available in electronic format within 30 days of request. Upon and including instructions on how to access the administrative record materials that are not available in electronic format, consistent with paragraph (c) below. The Chair and Vice Chair may set a later date for DTSC's performance of the requirements of this Rule 5 following a written request for consultation submitted by DTSC to the Clerk of the Board.~~

~~(b) Electronically available administrative record materials shall be uploaded to an online repository designated by the Clerk of the Board and organized and labeled in a manner corresponding to the administrative record index.~~

~~(c) Public access, as defined in paragraph (d) below, shall be provided for the administrative record materials that are not available in electronic format. Those administrative record materials shall be located in the same file room at a Regional Office reasonably proximate to the subject facility. DTSC shall provide all parties and the Board with written instructions to access the administrative record materials, including, where appropriate, identification of the custodian responsible for providing access, contact information of that custodian, and time and location for public access to the administrative record materials.~~

~~(d) Definition of Public Access. Public access to the administrative record materials has been provided if the materials are organized consistently with the administrative record index and are open for public inspection, such that a member of the public can reasonably locate, inspect, and review the materials after arranging access according to the instructions. Alternatively, public access has been provided if the administrative record materials are electronically available, pursuant to paragraph (b) above.~~

~~6. Meet and Confer Process. After receipt of the administrative record index, the Clerk of the Board shall notify the parties of the availability of the administrative record. The Clerk of the Board may schedule a meeting between direct representatives of BES staff, DTSC's Permitting Division, and the parties and DTSC to meet and confer regarding the completeness of the administrative record, the portions of the which administrative record that materials are available in electronic format, and other items as the parties deem appropriate. A complete Administrative Record includes all items listed in Section 66271.17 of Title 22 Regulations and described in the Appendix to this Order, which shall include particular records as agreed upon in the meet and confer. To the greatest extent feasible, all documents included in the administrative record should be available in electronic format by no later than the effective date of the Initial Order adopted by the Board pursuant to subsection (b) of Section 66271.72 of the Title 22 Regulations. The Clerk of the Board may also schedule a status conference including representatives of the parties and DTSC. Before the status conference, the Clerk of the Board may require representatives of the parties and DTSC to file appeal management statements using Form BES 2501.~~

~~7. Completion of the Administrative Record; Initial Order Timing. As directed by the Board Chair and Vice Chair, the Clerk of the Board may request that DTSC provide such material and~~

take such actions as needed to ensure completeness of the administrative record and public access to the administrative record materials. Any party may file a motion to augment or strike the administrative record within 60 days of ~~DTSC's Permitting Division's submission of the index to the Board.~~ notification by the Clerk of the Board of the availability of the administrative record pursuant to Rule 6. The Board Chair and Vice Chair shall direct the Clerk of the Board to complete the administrative record if no motion is timely filed. ~~If a party files a motion to strike or augment in the record~~ absence of exigent circumstances, the ~~Clerk of the Board shall complete~~ will not consider the Initial Order for adoption until the administrative record ~~upon disposition of the motion by the Board Chair and Vice Chair.~~ has been completed in accordance with this Rule 7.

~~(5)~~8. Content and form of briefs.

- (a) Content requirements. All briefs filed under this order must contain, under appropriate headings:
 - (i) A table of contents with page references;
 - (ii) A table of authorities with page references for citations;
 - (iii) A table of attachments, if required under ~~subparagraph (b) of~~ paragraph ~~(5)~~(b) of Rule 8 of this order; and
 - (iv) A statement of compliance with the word limitation.
- (b) Attachments. - Parts of the administrative record to which the parties wish to direct the Board's attention may be appended to the brief submitted. If the brief includes attachments, a table must be included that provides the title of each appended document and assigns a label identifying where it may be found.
- (c) Length. - Unless otherwise ordered by the Board, moving, opposition, and amicus briefs may not exceed 12,000 words and reply briefs may not exceed 6,000 words. Filers may rely on the word-processing system used to determine the word count. In lieu of a word limitation, filers may comply with a 25-page limit for moving, opposition, and amicus briefs, or a 12-page limit for reply briefs. Headings, footnotes, and quotations count toward the word limitation. The table of contents, table of authorities, table of attachments (if any), statement of compliance with the word limitation, and any attachments do not count toward the word limitation. As directed by the Board Chair and Vice Chair, the Clerk of the Board may exclude any moving, opposition, amicus, or reply brief that does not meet word limitations. Where a party can demonstrate a compelling and documented need to exceed such limitations, such party must seek advance leave of the Board Chair and Vice Chair to file a longer brief. Such requests are discouraged and will be granted only in unusual circumstances.

~~(6)~~9. Participation by Amicus Curiae. - With the written permission of the Board Chair and Vice Chair, any interested person who is not a party to the appeal may file an amicus brief in any hazardous waste facility permit appeal pending before the Board. The deadline for filing such brief is 30 days after the filing of ~~the DTSC Permitting Division's~~ DTSC's opposition brief. Amicus briefs must comply with all procedural requirements of this order, including service on all parties.

~~(7)~~10. Motions.

- (a) In general.- A request for a procedural order or other relief must be made by written motion unless these rules prescribe another form.
- (b) Contents of a motion. -A motion must state with particularity the grounds for the motion, the relief sought, and the legal argument necessary to support the motion. In advance of filing a motion, parties must attempt to ascertain whether the other party(ies) concur(s) or object(s) to the motion and must indicate in the motion the attempt made and the response obtained.
- (c) Response to motion. -Any party may file a response to a motion. Responses must state with particularity the grounds for opposition and the legal argument necessary to support the motion. The response must be filed within 15 days after service of the motion unless the Board shortens or extends the time for response.
- (d) Reply. -Any reply to a response filed under ~~subparagraph (c) of~~ paragraph ~~(7)c) of~~ Rule 9 of this order must be filed within 10 days after service of the response. A reply must not introduce any new issues or arguments and may respond only to matters presented in the response.
- (e) Length. -Unless otherwise ordered by the Board, motions and any responses or replies may not exceed 6000 words. Filers may rely on the word-processing system used to determine the word count. In lieu of a word limitation, filers may comply with a 12-page limit. Headings, footnotes, and quotations count toward the word or page-length limitation. As directed by the Board Chair and Vice Chair, the Clerk of the Board may exclude any motion that does not meet word limitations. Where a party can demonstrate a compelling and documented need to exceed such limitations, such party must seek advance leave of the Board Chair and Vice Chair. Such requests are discouraged and will be granted only in unusual circumstances.
- (f) Disposition of a motion for a procedural order. -The Board Chair and Vice Chair may act on a motion for a procedural order at any time without awaiting a response.

~~(8)~~11. Timing of motions for extension of time.- Parties must file motions for extensions of time sufficiently in advance of the due date to allow other parties to have a reasonable opportunity to respond to the request for more time and to provide the Board Chair and Vice Chair with a reasonable opportunity to determine the merits of the motion.

~~(9)~~12. Dismissal by Appellant.- By motion, Appellant may request to have the Board dismiss its appeal. The motion must briefly state the reason for its request.

~~(10)~~13. Filing requirements.- Documents filed under this order, including the petition for review, must be filed with the Clerk of the Board by no later than 5:00 pm on the last day to file. A document is filed when it is received by the Clerk of the Board at the address specified for the appropriate method of delivery as provided in ~~subparagraph (b) of~~ paragraph ~~(10)b) of~~ Rule 13 of this order.

- (a) Caption and other filing requirements.- Every document filed with the Board must specifically identify in the caption the permit applicant, the permitted facility, and the permit number. All documents that are filed must be signed by the person filing the documents or the representative of the person filing the documents. Each filing

must also indicate the signer's name, address, telephone number, and email address.

(b) Method of filing. -Unless otherwise permitted under these rules, documents must be filed either by using the portal on the Board's website, by email, by U.S. mail, or by hand delivery or courier (including delivery by U.S. Express Mail or by a commercial delivery service). The Board may by order require filing by email, subject to any appropriate conditions and limitations.

(i) Electronic filing. -Documents that are filed electronically must be uploaded to the portal on the Board's website or submitted to the Board's email address (appeals@bes.dtsc.ca.gov), subject to any appropriate conditions and limitations imposed by order of the Board. All documents filed electronically must include the full name of the person filing below the signature line. Compliance with Board electronic filing requirements constitutes compliance with applicable signature requirements.

(ii) Filing by U.S. Mail. -Documents that are sent by U.S. Postal Service (except by U.S. Express Mail) must be sent to the official mailing address of the Clerk of the Board at 1001 I Street, 25th Floor, PO Box 806, Sacramento, CA 95914-0806. The original and two copies of each document must be filed. The person filing the documents must include a cover letter to the Clerk of the Board clearly identifying the documents that are being submitted, the name of the party on whose behalf the documents are being submitted, as well as the name of the person filing the documents, his or her address, telephone number and, if available, email address.

(iii) Filing by hand delivery or courier. -Documents delivered by hand or courier (including deliveries by U.S. Express Mail or by a commercial delivery service) must be delivered to the Clerk of the Board at: 1001 I Street, 25th Floor, PO Box 806, Sacramento, CA 95914-0806.

~~(11)~~14. Service Requirements. - A proof of service must be appended to each document filed stating the names of persons served, the date and manner of service, as well as the electronic, mailing, or hand delivery address as appropriate. Service of a document between parties to an appeal or by the Board on a party is complete upon transmission by email or 3 days after mailing by U.S. mail.

(a) Service information. -The first document filed by any person shall contain the name, mailing address, telephone number, and email address of an individual authorized to receive service relating to the proceeding. Parties shall promptly file any changes in this information with the Clerk of the Board and serve copies on all parties to the proceeding. If a party fails to furnish such information and any changes thereto, service to the party's last known address shall satisfy the requirements of ~~paragraph (11)~~Rule 14 of this order.

(b) Service requirements for parties. - Appellant must file the petition for review with the Clerk of the Board and serve the petition for review on the Division Chief for the DTSC Permitting Division and the permit applicant (if the applicant is not the appellant). Once an appeal is filed, every document filed with the Board must be

served on all other parties. Service by email is preferred, or may be by first class U.S. mail, or any reliable commercial delivery service.

(c) Service of rulings, orders, and decisions. -The Clerk of the Board must serve copies of rulings, orders, and decisions on all parties. Service may be made by U.S. mail (including by certified mail or return receipt requested, Overnight Express and Priority Mail), any reliable commercial delivery service, or electronic means (including email) at the discretion of the Board.

~~(12)~~15. Days; Counting of Days.- Unless specified otherwise all references to “days” in this order shall refer to calendar days. Time periods shall be calculated in accordance with 22 CCR § 66271.21.

~~(13)~~16. Previous Order Rescinded. ~~This~~Except as provided by Rule 17, this order supersedes and replaces Standing Order ~~23~~24-01.

17. Effective Date; Application. This order shall be effective on the date adopted by the Board. This order does not apply to appeals filed before the Effective Date.

IT IS SO ORDERED that appeals filed with the Board shall be administered in accordance with the Rules established by this order.

Adopted at a public meeting of the Board held on ~~August 28, 2024~~November 17, 2025.

Member	Aye	Nye	Abstain	Absent	Recusal
Chair Rizzo <u>Rakestraw</u>	X				
Vice Chair Strauss-Hacker	X				
Member Bhatia	X				
Member Gomez	X				
Member Brostrom	X				

Clerk of the Board: _____
Sheena Q. Brooks

Approved as to Form: _____
Gregory A. Forest

EXHIBIT 1

FORM BES 2301

STANDARD APPEAL FORM

EXHIBIT 2

FORM BES 2302

SPECIAL APPEAL FORM

APPENDIX

Administrative Record Contents for a Hazardous Waste Facility Permit Decision

The administrative record for a decision to issue a hazardous waste facility permit under the Hazardous Waste Control Law is based on the standards set forth in California Code of Regulations, Title 22, section 66271.17. The materials in the administrative record do not include documents that are not subject to disclosure under the California Public Records Act, but should include the following public records:

Part 1. For a final hazardous waste facility permit decision:

- a. Index of documents included in the record.
- b. Permit application, including checklists and documents submitted under separate covers (trial burn report, geotechnical report, risk assessment report, tank assessment report, etc.), and any supporting data furnished by the applicant.
- c. Draft permit and corresponding administrative record or notice of intent to deny the application.
- d. Statement of Basis or Fact Sheet, and all documents cited therein.
- e. All comments received during the public comment period, including any extended or reopened public comment period.
- f. The tape or transcript of any public meeting or hearing.
- g. Any written materials submitted at any public meeting or hearing.
- h. DTSC's response to public comments, including documents cited in the response and new materials placed in the record as a result of public comments and DTSC's response.
- i. Other documents contained in the supporting file for the final permit as described in Part 2 of this Appendix.
- j. The final permit.

Part 2. Documents applicable to the final permit decision, which fall under "Other documents contained in the supporting file," shall include any and all documents relied on in the final permit decision, which may include the following:

- a. Compliance evaluation inspection and other enforcement reports, including checklists, exhibits, tables, maps, photographs, and statements of witnesses.

- ~~b. Violation Scoring Procedure (VSP) correspondence, tier challenge submittals, presentations from tier challenge meetings, audit reports, and compliance implementation plans.~~
- ~~c. Documents related to corrective action, cleanup, closure, and post-closure activities, including site investigations, environmental assessments, RCRA Facility Investigations, and related technical reports.~~
- ~~d. Correspondence, including records of tips or complaints from the public and any resulting enforcement reports or memoranda.~~
- ~~e. Memoranda on facility-specific or issue-specific policy decisions.~~
- ~~f. Documents of public participation activities, including: Public Participation Plan, community profile, newspaper and other public notices, fact sheets, documents sent to persons on the site mailing list and the mailing list itself, documentation of public meetings, public comments, and responses to comments.~~
- ~~g. Enforcement orders, consent orders, stipulation and orders, agreements, interim status documents, closure plans, and post closure plans that have relevant information not contained elsewhere in the record.~~
- ~~h. Public documents generated or received in prior or pending legal proceedings, such as affidavits, subpoenas, deposition and hearing transcripts, pleadings and briefs that have relevant information not contained elsewhere in the record.~~
- ~~i. Documents generated or received by DTSC's Board of Environmental Safety (BES) during or related to the proceedings before BES on the appeal of an earlier hazardous waste facility permit decision for the facility.~~
- ~~j. Documentation under California Environmental Quality Act (CEQA).~~
- ~~k. Records of other regulatory agencies' activities concerning the facility not contained elsewhere in the record.~~

EXHIBIT 3

FORM BES 2501

APPEAL MANAGEMENT
FORM